

Asian Development Policy Review

ISSN(e): 2313-8343

ISSN(p): 2518-2544

DOI: 10.18488/journal.107/2015.3.3/107.3.61.75

Vol. 3, No. 3, 61-75

© 2015 AESS Publications. All Rights Reserved.

URL: www.aessweb.com

THE REPRESENTABILITY OF CITY COUNCILS IN TURKEY: THE CASE OF KAHRAMANMARAS PROVINCE



Uğur YILDIRIM¹

Zehra GÜL²

Soner AKIN³⁺

Celalettin ŞEN⁴

Murtaza ERSÖZ⁵

¹Kahramanmaraş Sutcu Imam University, Faculty of Economic and Administrative Sciences, Public Administration Department, Turkey

²Kahramanmaraş Sutcu Imam University, Faculty of Economic and Administrative Sciences, Health Services Management Department, Turkey

³Mustafa Kemal University, Kırıkhan Vocational School, Turkey

^{4,5}Kahramanmaraş Sutcu Imam University, Social Sciences Institute, Turkey

(+ Corresponding author)

ABSTRACT

Keywords

Turkey
City councils
Local community
Representability
Kahramanmaraş
Local democracy.

JEL Classification:

H83, H70, L31.

The role of local governments has recently increased in importance, and as reforms and restructuring of their functions have revealed, the concept of "representation and participation" is coming into prominence." Notably, the representation of local communities within the decisions is mainly taken on behalf of society gained importance. The city councils, which are under the focal scope of our study, are the ones constituted by "local representatives" being elected by local communities and responsible for protecting the rights of society. The acknowledgement of representatives by society, the representatives' own recognition of society and also representing issue emerged as important determinants so that the function of representation might materialize as effective. This study examined the represent ability of city council members in Turkey within the case of Kahramanmaraş Province in Turkey. Hence, the profile of all city council members was presented, and then the views and approaches of them were discussed. The elicited approaches and views which belong to the members were mainly probed within the frame of "represent ability of city council members".

Contribution/ Originality: This study is unique and original on paying attention for demographic features' own effects through the representation facilities and organs' using. Indeed, instead of a more theoretical scanning framework, a unique study on researching the available position of a city on local representation was performed.

1. INTRODUCTION

The concept representation is described as a type of action in which an individual or a group acts on behalf of a larger group (Yildirim, 1993). Representation binds the rulers and the ruled in a platform where the views of groups are defended and their interests guaranteed (Oktay, 2013a). Electing the representatives at certain intervals with a free choice, the responsibility of representatives upon his society, the issue of representatives' being a case upon society's representation could be mainly accepted as the items of a system based on representation (Toplak, 2003). Shortly the representation, election, responsibility and representable power are the main concepts in which the representation mechanism laid on Aksu and Kurtulus (2011). The uncrowded times' direct type of representation in which everyone having specific characteristics (gender, age, race, social and economic status, etc.) represents themselves by voting the every decision which is related with them (Örs, 2006) is not seen possible in our time, thus the function of representation is realized with the method as indirect representation. Indeed, there exist some basic supportive points and values of local governments in the representation system, which are "freedom, equality, solidarity, political responsibility and participation" (Çitçi, 1996).

Along with study a case work was performed for the representation issue via municipality councils, specifically for the province Kahramanmaraş in Turkey. This study contributes in the existing literature about representation issue at the local level. It gives new estimation methodology upon the demographic and politically activist factors' weight on representation power in a city. This study is one of very few studies which have investigated representation power issue for local organs in Turkey. The paper contributes the first logical analysis on the real reflection of representation.

2. THE EVALUATION OF THE DATUM OBTAINED BY QUESTIONNAIRE

Some parts of the datum obtained by the questionnaire is interpreted by giving tables, and some others are evaluated without tables.

2.1. Participation in the Questionnaire and the Ratio of Returns and the Features of People Who Participated in the Study and Memberships and the Representation Characteristics

When the total member of municipality council in Kahramanmaraş province as 251 was paid attention, it was seen that 61.75 % of council members participated to the questionnaire, and replied the questions. According to this, it is seen that 31 council members in the county municipality Dulkadiroğlu (AKP: 27, MHP: 4) of metropolitan municipality, and 37 council members (AKP:29, MHP:8) of Onikişubat county exist. Looking at the other counties; the portrayal for municipality council members is shown in those datum as Afşin: 25 (AKP:15, MHP:10), Andırın: 15 (AKP:8, MHP:5, CHP:2), Çağlayanerit: 15 (AKP:9, MHP:5, CHP:1), Ekinözü: 11 (AKP:6, CHP:3, SP:2), Elbistan: 31 (AKP:19, MHP:12), Göksun: 25 (AKP:15, MHP:10), Nurhak: 11 (AKP:3, MHP:3, CHP:5), Pazarcık: 25 (AKP:14, MHP:1, CHP: 10) and Türkoğlu:25 (AKP:19, MHP:6) (www.yzk.gov.tr, 2014). 139 of the council members who participated in the questionnaire (89.7%) are male, 16 of them (10.3%) are female. Almost every member of

Kahramanmaraş municipality council is born in Kahramanmaraş (99.4 %). Among 155 members who participated in the questionnaire, 136 of them (87.8%) live in Kahramanmaraş more than 30 years. 7 of the council members who participated in the questionnaire (4.5%) are from the age range as 25-30, plus 15 of them (9.7%) are from the age range as 31-36, and 83 of them (53.5%) are from the middle age group around the range as 43-54. 25 of the rest (16.1%) are around the age from the range as 37-42, and the other 25 is from the group as older members (16.1%) named as 54 and above. 67 of council members (43.2%) are graduated from high school, 42 of them (27.1%) are graduated from university, and 10 of the others are graduated from primary school (6.5%), 11 of them are graduated from middle school (7.1%), and 22 of them are graduated from college (14.2%). Only 3 of the participants in questionnaire have the post graduate degree (1.9%). 43.2 % of the participants in questionnaire are composed by self-employed members. The distribution of council members based on political parties: When it is paid attention, 125 of the members who compose the council are from AKP (80.6%). Indeed, 23 of the participant in questionnaire is from (14.8%) MHP, 6 of them are from (3.9%) CHP and 1 of them (0.6%) is from SP. When the distribution of municipality council members is paid attention in Kahramanmaraş, it is seen that the other parties had less members. The duties of council members in parties before they are elected: 120 of the majority of the municipality councils had party membership (77.4%), but the others had different levels of active duties. 12 of them worked for youth branches (7.7%), 10 of them were (6.5%) in boards of management, and the others had the duties as central executive committee membership, women branches membership and county speakership. The reasons for going into politics: According to the importance level, the party members declared the reasons upon their own going into politics as the effect of idealism (74.2%), not being a member of another party before (69%), the result of the activities of NGOs (67.1%), being the first member to go into politics from a family with loyalty (62.2%) and seeing the membership of a political party as the most important subject for their part (60.6%). According to the results herein, the majority of municipality members states that the reason of their going into politics are mainly the effect of idealism, the results of NGO activities and the intent on being a new actor in politics.

38.1% of the council members who participated in questionnaire are members of a NGO, but more than the half are not a member of any NGO (61.9%). The majority of the members who participated in questionnaire are firstly elected as council member (92.3%), 5.2% of them are elected as second time, and 2.6% of them is elected as the third time for council membership. The majority of council members stated that the factors upon being elected a member could be the ones in which the political thought background is the weightiest with the ratio on point of view as 81.3%, on the other hand they thought that these could be the least important factors with the ratio of shared points as the relations with NGOs 63.9%, the families 55.5% and occupations 51.6%. The most important effective factors upon the municipality council members are the weight of region's national parliament deputies as 69.7%, the citizens/townsmen as 68.4%, the party group leaders as 66.5% and neighborhood mukhtars as 65.2%. Following this, the group quart factor as mayors-the board of municipalities-municipality council-NGOs seems in 64.5%, and the other triple factor based group mayor-board of municipality-municipality council reveals

in 62.6%. The big majority of council members (68.4%) states that they allocate time council activities every week, and among them especially the commission actives are stated as the most effective ones with 65.2%. Looking at the distribution of council members, it is seen that they are elected based on the degree of importance, and they represent the whole society whom belongs to the place they are elected (89.7%). On the other hand, the least important fraction that the council members represent are stated as the some interest and sanction groups (79.4%), some delegation groups (69.7) and the groups who are in the same line with their thoughts (57.4%). Moreover, when the degree of importance is paid attention, as to the council members the handicapped group (50.3%), youngsters (43.2%) and women (40.6%) are not represented fairly but the old people are represented efficiently (56.8%). As to the order of importance, the council members stated that they benefited from all the processes as on the job training programs, making use of the experiences of old veterans, getting the most out of policy academy, receiving support from party and getting help from the processes as autonomous learning by the time.

2.2. Hypothesis and Analysis about the Political and Managerial Representation Features

Table-1. The political and managerial representation features and the reliability analysis results about the representation characteristics

	Cronbach's Alpha	N of Items
The political and managerial representation features	0.670	19
Representation characteristics	0.725	77

Since the reliability analysis upon the political and managerial representation characteristics of council members is paid attention, Cronbach's Alpha value is equal to 0,670 on behalf of the political and managerial representation, but it seems 0.725 in terms of representation features. Cronbach's Alpha multiplier within the range as 0.60-0.80 is accepted as efficient for scale in literature. When the open ended questions are handled in the questionnaire, the main aim of council members for membership is understood as the service for society (1). In addition to this, the others were stated as representing the society (2), producing solutions for the problems of society (3) and the ones which define their membership to the council being upon demands by the parties or somewhere another within the scope of ordinary activities of council membership (4). The majority of council replied the question about the most important problem of council with those answers as (a) not paying attention to all members (b) not satisfying the all needs of society (c) the problems of being approving council. Those following hypothesis are composed by the research topics within the questions' analysis about –political, indirect, sociologic representation.

H1: There is no significant difference between the genders of council members and their representation characteristics.

Along with this hypothesis, it was aimed to explore whether the gender differences' effects exist on representation features. In order to determine if there exist a significant difference

between the council members' genders and their representation characteristics, the independent sample T-Test analysis was performed. According to the obtained results, there seems a significant difference on behalf of the genders of council members and the three statements about the representation characteristics, and there determined no difference on behalf of the others. When those statements about the genders of council members are paid attention, the significance levels are rejected for the proposals as "the civil servants; academicians etc. have to be natural members of municipalities without giving up their jobs ($p=0,004<0.05$)", "I believe that the female representatives could produce solutions for the problems of 'women' or 'women' ($p=0,016<0.05$)", "increasing the representation rate of women in politics would contribute in the solution of women problems ($p=00,011<0.05$)", yet the other problems are accepted. Hence those results show that woman representatives didn't believe that the increasing representation rate had helped the solution of women's problems, and the natural members should have dealt with only the problems in councils.

H2: There is no significant difference between the genders of council members and which fractions of municipality council are represented, and also how they are delegated

Table-2. Independent Sample T-Test related about council member genders and which fractions in the council are represented in what manner

	F	Sig.	t	Df	Sig. (2-tailed)	Hypothesis
Women	,376	,541	-,665	145	,507	Accepted
Youngsters	,036	,849	-1,055	145	,293	Accepted
Handicapped	2,699	,103	-1,882	145	,062	Accepted
Elders	3,367	,069	-3,517	145	,001	Rejected

The aim of hypothesis is to investigate whether the genders of council members affect their thoughts about the fractions they represented. As is seen in Table 6, the independent sample t-test analysis was performed in order to determine whether there exist a significant difference between the genders of council members and which fractions of council are represented in what manner of degree. According to the obtained results, on behalf of which fractions are represented and the genders of council members there exist no difference in terms of women, youngsters and the handicapped people, yet a difference ($p=0,001<0.05$) is available for elders. The difference within the elder peoples' fraction is derived from the situation that men have the average as 4.12, and women have 2.79 on average, though the other fractions' average is significantly far away from the elders' average. As to the results, H2 hypothesis is rejected only for the elders' fraction, yet it is accepted for the other fractions.

H3: There is no significant difference between the municipality council members' ages and how they went into politics

In this hypothesis, it is investigated that whether the criteria as age is effective on the council members' entering into politics. One-way ANOVA analysis was performed in the Table- 7 in order to determine whether there exists a significant difference between the ages of council members and how they went into politics. According to the obtained results, the statements in

which the significant differences were found between the ages of council members and how they entered into the politics are seen as “I am rooted from a family which deals with politics.”

Table-3. One way ANOVA Results performed for the relation between the ages of municipality council members and how they went into politics

	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.	Hypothesis
I wasn't rooted from a family which dealt with politics but there were members interested in	8,587	5	1,717	1,805	,115	Acceptance
There are members who went into the politics with me	6,202	5	1,240	1,479	,200	Acceptance
I am rooted from a family delat with politics	18,256	5	3,651	3,041	,012	Rejection
I want a member of political paty before.	13,211	5	2,642	1,549	,178	Acceptance
Being a member of political party.	23,269	5	4,654	2,367	,042	Rejection
Being the reults of NGO activities.	9,211	5	1,842	1,115	,355	Acceptance
Being the result of my occupational success.	9,835	5	1,967	1,728	,132	Acceptance
Being a member of a party's youth branch	15,315	5	3,063	5,098	,000	Rejection
Under the effects of my friend circle.	3,660	5	,732	,949	,451	Acceptance
Under the effect of political party leader	2,948	5	,590	,599	,700	Acceptance
Under the effect of idealism	10,583	5	2,117	1,319	,259	Acceptance
Along with the future anxiety	9,977	5	1,995	1,576	,170	Acceptance
For social prestige	1,131	5	,226	,797	,554	Acceptance

($p=0,012<0,05$), “Being a member of a political party” ($p=0,042<0,05$) and “Being a member of a political party's youth branch” ($p=0,000<0,05$). In order to determine where those differences are derived from, TUKEY test, among the multiple comparative research methods, was performed. As a result of multiple comparative test, it is seen that there exists a difference between the group average points which belong to the people around 43-48 years old and the ones 49-54 years old [$F(5-144)=3,041$, $0,013<0,05$]. The other difference was determined for the people who stated that they went into politics via being member of a political party who are between the ages 31-36 and the others 37-42 years old [$F(5-145)=2,367$, $0,027<0,05$]. The third difference was pointed for the people who stated they went into politics being a member of youth branch of a political party around the ages 25-30 and the ones 37-42 years old [$F(5-145)=5,098$, $0,002<0,05$], besides the ones 43-48 years old [$F(5-145)=5,098$, $0,028<0,05$], 54 and above years old [$F(5-145)=5,098$, $0,003<0,05$] show significant difference for group average points. Besides the group average points of council members around 31-36 years old who stated that they went into politics being a member of a political party's youth branch and the ones' group average points whose ages are following around 37-42 [$F(5-145)=5,098$, $0,025<0,05$] and 54- and above [$F(5-145)=5,098$, $0,029<0,05$] showed a significant difference again. According to this, the hypothesis **H3** is accepted for the statements for “I was rooted from a family who dealt with politics”, “being a member for a political party” and “being a member of a political party's youth branch”.

H4: There is no significant difference between the ages of municipality council members and the factors upon being selected as council member.

The aim of this hypothesis is to investigate whether the factor for age is effective upon the elections on municipality council members. One way ANOVA analysis was performed and showed in Table-8 in order to determine that there exist a significant difference between the ages of municipality council members and the factors on being elected. According to the obtained results, it is determined that there exist a significant difference between the ages of council members and

the factors as “my political concern/background” ($p=0,023<0.05$). In order to understand where this difference is rooted, multiple comparative TUKEY test is performed. As a result of this multiple comparative test, it was determined that there exist a difference between the group averaged of council members around 43-48 years old and the ones 49-54 years old [$F(5-144)=2.703$, $0,006<0.05$]. According to this, the hypothesis H4 is rejected for the statement as “my political concerns/background”, but is accepted for the others.

Table-4. One-way ANOVA Analysis results about the ages of municipality council members and the factors upon being elected as municipality council member

	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.	Hypothesis
My political concerns/ background	7,885	5	1,577	2,703	,023	Rejected
My family	2,634	5	,527	,811	,544	Accepted
My job/career	16,421	5	3,284	2,016	,080	Accepted
My relation with NGOs	2,139	5	,428	,349	,882	Accepted

H5: There exist no significant difference between the ages of municipality council members' ages and who are effective upon the decision made by the municipality councils.

Table-5. The results of one-way ANOVA Analysis about the relation between what institutions or people are effective upon the decisions made by councils and the gender of council member ages

	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.	Hypothesis
Mayor himself/herself	2,280	5	,456	,891	,489	Acceptance
Mayor, the board of municipality, municipality council	1,186	5	,237	,446	,816	Acceptance
Mayor, the board of municipality, municipality council and NGOs	9,858	5	1,972	3,214	,009	Rejection
Region deputies of national parliament	1,829	5	,366	,804	,548	Acceptance
Party group leader	,544	5	,109	,270	,929	Acceptance
Townsmen/citizens	4,865	5	,973	1,297	,268	Acceptance
Neighborhood headman (mukhtar)	6,081	5	1,216	1,679	,143	Acceptance
Political party organization	2,32	5	,464	,638	,671	Acceptance
Chamber of Industry and Commerce	,206	5	,041	,690	,632	Acceptance
Local sanction groups	2,263	5	,453	,374	,866	Acceptance
Opinion leaders	1,218	5	,244	1,064	,383	Acceptance

In this hypothesis, the relation between the ages of council members and what people or institutions are effective upon the decisions made councils is determined. One-way ANOVA analysis results which is about which institutions or people are effective upon decision of council and the ages of the council members exist in the Table-9. In the analysis which was performed in order to determine whether there exist a significant difference between the ages of council members and the decisions made by the councils, only for statement as (mayor, the municipal board, the council of municipality and NGOs) showed a significant difference. In order to understand the reason of this difference, TUKEY Test was performed among the multiple comparative tests. As a result of this multiple comparison test, it was determined that there exists a difference between the group average points of the council members whose ages are around 43-48 and the ones 49-54 years old [$F(5-144) = 3.214$, $0,003<0.05$]. According to this, the hypothesis **H5** is rejected for the statement as “mayor, the municipal board, municipality council and NGOs and accepted for the others.

H6: There exists no significant difference between the ages of municipality council members' ages and which fractions are represented at which degree.

In this hypothesis, it is investigated that what the ages of council members are and which fractions are represented.

Table-6. One way ANOVA Analysis Results for the council members' ages and which fractions they represent.

	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.	Hypothesis
Women	9,923	5	1,985	1,337	,252	Accepted
Youngsters	2,531	5	,506	,364	,873	Accepted
Handicapped People	7,609	5	1,522	1,147	,338	Accepted
Elders	44,101	5	8,820	5,120	,000	Rejection

One way ANOVA analysis is performed and shown in Table -10 in order to determine whether there exist a significant difference between the ages of council members and which fractions are represented in the councils. According to the obtained results, it is determined that a significant difference between the ages of council members and the fraction of elders exists ($p=0,000<0.05$). Among the multiple comparative tests, TUKEY test was performed in order to understand the reason of this difference. As a result of this multiple comparative test, it is determined that there exists a significant difference between the average group points of the people whose ages are around 31-36 and the ones 49-54 years old [$F(5-144)=5.120, 0,002<0.05$]. Besides, it is determined that there also exists a significant difference between the average points of group whose age is around 43-48 and the average group points of the ones who are 49-54 years old [$F(5-145)=5.120, 0,004<0.05$]. As to this, H6 hypothesis is rejected for elders and accepted for the others.

H7: There exists no significant difference between the ages of municipality council members and the must on giving natural membership status for which groups in municipality council.

Table-7. One way ANOVA Analysis Results upon the ages of municipality council members and the must on giving natural membership status for which groups in municipality council

	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.	Hypothesis
Neighborhood headmen	22,434	5	4,487	3,337	,007	Rejected
University staff members	1,454	5	,291	,192	,965	Accepted
Industrialists	17,231	5	3,446	2,412	,039	Rejected
Self employed people	18,818	5	3,764	2,484	,034	Rejected
Agriculture manager	15,608	5	3,122	2,041	,077	Accepted
Merchants	13,546	5	2,709	1,749	,127	Accepted
Craftsmen and little artisans	21,326	5	4,265	3,023	,013	Rejected
To NGOs	5,145	5	1,029	,719	,610	Accepted
To Chambers	7,638	5	1,528	,977	,434	Accepted
To Noone	1,333	3	,444	,148	,922	Accepted
To All of them	3,026	5	,605	1,049	,399	Accepted

The aim of this hypothesis is to investigate the ages of council members and which members in the councils have to be given natural membership. One way ANOVA analysis is performed and shown in table 11, in order to determine that whether there exist a significant different between the ages of council members and which groups in the council need to be given the natural membership status. According to the obtained results, it was determined that there exists a significant difference between the ages of council members and “the neighborhood headmen (mukhtars)” ($p=0,007<0.05$), “industrialists” ($p=0,039<0.05$), “self-employed people” ($p=0,034<0.05$), and “craftsmen and artisans” ($p=0,013<0.05$). Among the multiple comparative tests, TUKEY test was performed in order to determine the reason of this difference on behalf of

all groups. As to the multiple comparative test results, it was found that there exists a difference between the average group points of council members in the neighborhood headmen group being around 43-48 years old and the average group points of the ones 49-54 years old [$F(5-144)=3.337, 0,018<0.05$], and another difference between the average group points of the members in the ages around 49-54 and the average group points of the ones who are 54 and above years old. [$F(5-144)=3.337, 0,042<0.05$]. The difference between the average group points of the members in the industrialists group being 31-36 years old and the average group points of the ones who are 49-54 years old was determined as well [$F(5-144)=2.412, 0,036<0.05$]. The difference between the average group points of craftsmen and artisans in council being 31-36 years old and the average group points of the ones being 49-54 years old was also determined [$F(5-144)=3.023, 0,020<0.05$]. As to this, the hypothesis H7 was rejected for “neighborhood headmen”, “industrialists”, “self-employed people” and “craftsmen and artisans” but accepted for the others.

H8: There exists no significant difference between the education of municipality council members and their representation ability.

Table-8. The results of One-Way ANOVA Analysis upon the relation between the education of council members and their representation ability

	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.	Hypothesis
Giving the service as on the job training	15,730	5	3,146	3,057	,012	Rejected
Benefiting from political academy	5,752	5	1,150	1,412	,224	Accepted
Benefiting from the experience of elder members	1,452	5	,290	,312	,905	Accepted
Benefiting from political party	9,009	5	1,802	1,843	,108	Accepted
Self learning by the course of time	20,883	5	4,177	3,217	,009	Rejected

The aim of hypothesis is to investigate the effects of council members' education upon the process for developing representation ability. One-way ANOVA analysis was performed and shown in Table 12 in order to determine that whether there exists a significant difference between the education of council members and the processes for developing the representation ability. As to the obtained results, there exists a significant difference between the education level of municipality council members and the statements as “benefiting from the services as on the job training” ($p=0,012<0.05$), “self-learning in the course of time” ($p=0,009<0.05$). In order to fix the reason of this difference, among the multiple comparative tests the TUKEY Test was performed. As a result of the multiple comparative test, a significant difference between the average group points of council members who think that the on- job training could develop the ability on representation, having the education level as primary school graduate, and the average group points of the ones as high school graduate [$F(5-141)=3.057, 0,036<0.05$] and the university graduate [$F(5-141)=3.057, 0,013<0.05$] was determined. Again, as another result of multiple comparative test, there exists a significant difference between the average group points of council members who think that the education level could change the ability upon representation, being middle school graduate and the average group points of the ones high school graduate [$F(5-142)=3.217, 0,002<0.05$] and university graduate [$F(5-141)=3.217, 0,033<0.05$]. As to this the

hypothesis **H8** is rejected for the statements as “giving the on the job training” and “self-learning by the course of time” and accepted for the others.

H9: There exists no significant difference between the education levels of council members and what institution or who are effective upon the decisions made by municipality councils.

Table-9. One-way ANOVA analysis results about the relation between the education level of council members and which institutions/who are effective upon the decisions made by municipality council

	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.	Hypothesis
Mayor by himself	1,786	5	,357	,693	,630	Accepted
Mayor, municipal board and municipality council	,511	5	,102	,190	,966	Accepted
Mayor, municipal board, municipality council and NGOs	8,094	5	1,619	2,586	,028	Rejected
Region's deputies of national parliament	3,107	5	,621	1,394	,230	Accepted
Party group leaders	2,323	5	,465	1,188	,318	Accepted
Townsmen/ citizens	1,653	5	,331	,428	,829	Accepted
Neighborhood headmen	1,932	5	,386	,513	,766	Accepted
The organization of political parties	3,137	5	,627	,869	,504	Accepted
The chamber of commerce and industry	,190	5	,038	,635	,673	Accepted
Local sanction groups	8,030	5	1,606	1,374	,237	Accepted
Opinion leaders	,802	5	,160	,692	,630	Accepted

Along with this hypothesis, the relation between the education level of council members and which institutions and who are effective upon the decisions made by councils was investigated. One-way ANOVA analysis was performed and shown in Table 13 in order to investigate the relation between the education levels of council members and which institutions and who are effective upon the decisions made by councils. In the analysis which was performed to understand whether there exists a significant difference between the education level of council members and which institutions and who are effective upon the decisions made councils, the significant difference was only found for the statements as “mayor, municipal board, municipality council and NGOs”. The TUKEY test among the multiple comparative tests was performed in order to determine where this difference is derived. As a result of the multiple comparative tests, when all groups are conjugate and investigated, it was found that there exists no group having a difference among them. Indeed, only if generally all groups are handled, there would be seen a so called difference across the groups in the one way ANOVA test. According to this H9 hypothesis is rejected.

H10: There exists no difference between the education levels of municipality councils and which fractions are represented in the municipality council

Table-10. The results of one way ANOVA analysis which is about the relation between the education level of municipality council members and the fractions represented in the council

	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.	Hypothesis
Women	8,590	5	1,718	1,150	,337	Accepted
Youngsters	13,056	5	2,611	1,983	,085	Accepted
The handicapped people	7,148	5	1,430	1,075	,377	Accepted
The elder people	30,071	5	6,014	3,301	,008	Rejected

The aim of the hypothesis is to investigate the relation between the education level of council members and the fraction represented in the council. One way ANOVA analysis was performed

and shown in the Table 14 in order to show the relation between the education levels of council members and which fractions represented in the council. According to the obtained results, there exists a significant difference between the education levels of council members and the elder people's fraction ($p=0,008<0.05$). In order to determine where this difference is derived, among the multiple comparative tests TUKEY test was performed. As a result of the multiple comparative test, it was found that there existed a difference between the average group points of the council members being middle school graduate and the group average points of the ones as high school graduate [$F(5-141)=3.301, 0,004<0.05$] and college graduates [$F(5-141)=3.301, 0,008<0.05$].

Table-11. One way ANOVA Analysis Results about the relation between the education levels of municipality council members and the groups for which the natural membership cadres to be planned in municipality councils.

	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.	Hypothesis
Neighborhood headmen	27,516	5	5,503	4,206	,001	Rejected
University staff members	6,631	5	1,326	,897	,485	Acceptance
Industrialists	16,263	5	3,253	2,266	,051	Acceptance
Self-employed people	22,690	5	4,538	3,051	,012	Rejected
Agricultural firm managers	13,827	5	2,765	1,793	,118	Acceptance
Merchants	16,051	5	3,210	2,097	,069	Acceptance
Craftsmen and artisans	26,351	5	5,270	3,832	,003	Rejected
To NGOs	3,432	5	,686	,475	,794	Acceptance
To the Chambers	10,886	5	2,177	1,413	,223	Acceptance
To noone	2,133	1	2,133	1,371	,326	Acceptance
To all of them	2,724	4	,681	,674	,615	Acceptance

According to this, H10 hypothesis is rejected for the fraction of elders but accepted for the others.

H11: There exists no significant difference between the education level of municipality councils and the groups for which natural membership cadres to be planned in municipality councils

In this hypothesis, the relation between the education levels of council members and the natural membership was investigated. One-way ANOVA analysis was performed and shown in Table 15 in order to determine that whether there exists a significant difference between the education levels of municipality council members and which fractions in the municipality councils need to be given the status of natural membership. According to the obtained results, it was determined that there exists a significant difference between the education level of municipality council members and “neighborhood headmen” ($p=0,001<0.05$), “self-employed people” ($p=0,012<0.05$), and “craftsmen and artisans” ($p=0,003<0.05$). In order to understand what the reason of this difference is, among the multiple comparative tests TUKEY test was performed. As a result of this multiple comparative test, it was found that the education levels of municipality council members showed a significant difference between the average group points of the ones who are primary school graduate and the points of high school graduates [$F(5-141)=4.206, 0,002<0.05$] and the points of college graduates [$F(5-141)=4.206, 0,003<0.05$]. It was determined that in the fraction of municipality council, which was composed by self-employed people, there exist a significant difference for education levels of council members between the average group points middle school graduates and the points of high school graduates [$F(5-$

139)=3.051, 0,011<0.05)]. It was determined that among the fraction for craftsmen and artisans there exists as significant difference between the average group points of council members who are primary school graduate and the points of ones being high school graduates [$F(5-141)=3.832$, 0,024<0.05)]. According to this, the hypothesis H11 is rejected for “neighborhood headmen”, “self-employed people” and “craftsmen and little artisans” but accepted for the others.

H12: There exists no significant difference between the education level of municipality council members and their representation characteristics.

In this hypothesis, it was investigated that the education level of council members are effective upon the features of representation. One way ANOVA analysis was performed in order to determine that whether there exists a significant difference between the education levels of members and the characteristics of representation. According to the obtained results, there exists a difference between the statements as “the local society is effective upon the determination of municipality council members by parties” and “instead of who are the ones voted for the municipality council membership, the activities they performed or would be performed is more important.” Although the relevance between the education level of municipality members and “the local society is effective upon the determination of municipality council members by their own parties.” is ($p= 0,009<0.05$), the relevance for “instead of who are the ones voted for the municipality council membership, the activities they performed or would be performed is more important. Difference is ($p= 0,008<0.05$). In order to find the reason of this difference, among the multiple comparative tests, TUKEY test is performed. As a result of the multiple comparative test, when the education level of the members who thought the local society is effective upon the determination of municipality council members by their own parties, it was seen that there exist no difference for a group, yet if all groups were generally handled, there would be seen a so-called difference across the groups after the one way ANOVA test. Again as a result of multiple comparative test, it was found significant differences between the average group point of the council members who thought “instead of who are the ones voted for the municipality council membership, the activities they performed or would be performed is more important.” being post graduate and the average group points of primary school graduates [$F(5-133)=3.101$, 0,003<0.05)], the points of middle school graduates [$F(5-133)=3.101$, 0,010<0.05)], the points of high school graduates [$F(5-133)=3.101$, 0,006<0.05)], the points of college graduates [$F(5-133)=3.101$, 0,003<0.05)] and the points of university graduates [$F(5-133)=3.101$, 0,004<0.05)]. According to this the hypothesis H12 is rejected only for the statement as “instead of who are the ones voted for the municipality council membership, the activities they performed or would be performed is important.” but accepted for the others.

H13: There exist a significant difference between the period which the municipality members live in Kahramanmaraş and the processes which they used for developing their own representation abilities.

The aim of this hypothesis is to investigate what the effect of the period they lived in their living city is upon their representation ability's development. The results of the correlation analysis which is about the period they had lived in Kahramanmaraş and their development process upon their own representation ability. It was determined that there exists a significant

and positive relation between the period in which the council members had lived in Kahramanmaraş and the council members who benefited from the experiences of elder members ($p=0,017<0.05$) and the ones who stated that they would develop their abilities in council by getting help from the party ($p=0,017<0.05$). In other words, for the extension of time, the case for benefiting from elder members and parties increases. According to this, it is seen that the hypothesis H13 is accepted.

Table-12. One way ANOVA Analysis Results about the education level of municipality members and their representation characteristics

	Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.	Hypothesis
Municipality council members might be loyal to the demands and willings of the political party they are bound to.	8,365	5	1,673	1,688	,142	Acceptance
The all fractions of society is sufficiently represented in the municipality council	10,728	5	2,146	1,752	,127	Acceptance
NGOs are represented fairly in the municipality council	9,162	5	1,832	1,251	,289	Acceptance
The local people are interested in the decisions made by municipality council	7,541	5	1,508	1,302	,267	Acceptance
My elected position as a council member is effective upon solving the problems of county.	13,161	5	2,632	2,284	,050	Acceptance
It was be sustained that the civil servants, academicians etc have to be natural members of municipality council without giving up their own jobs	5,543	5	1,109	,826	,533	Acceptance
The rule of lists has to be applied in the elections and the townsmen have to vote for delegated instead of the parties	1,053	5	,211	,180	,970	Acceptance
The local people are represented fairly in today's election mechanism fairly.	2,980	5	,596	,423	,832	Acceptance
It is better than the available position that the members of municipality council members /delegates have to be determined by the local society.	3,575	5	,715	,671	,646	Acceptance
Local people only confirm the list of political parties which was determined by the political parties.	4,713	5	,943	,786	,561	Acceptance
The local people are effective upon determining the members of municipality councils by political parties	17,457	5	3,491	3,242	,009	Rejected
The primary elections have to be performed to determine the persons who will be nominees for the election municipality council membership, along with the participation of party members and delegates for those procedure.	5,262	5	1,052	,974	,436	Acceptance
Instead of who are the ones voted for the municipality council membership, the activities they performed is important.	15,504	5	3,101	3,302	,008	Rejected
For a good election, the municipality council members who would go into the election have to introduce themselves in the meetings of neighborhoods and cottages.	6,309	5	1,262	1,506	,192	Acceptance
The opposite parties are fairly represented in the municipality councils.	4,147	5	,829	,657	,657	Acceptance
In order to realize the fuction of local representation, the neighborhood headmen have to exist in the municipality councils.	7,789	5	1,558	1,109	,359	Acceptance
The members of municipality councils represent their own parties/political voters	3,782	5	,756	,550	,738	Acceptance
The members of municipality members represent the society in which they are elected.	5,246	5	1,049	,815	,541	Acceptance
The local society doesn't respect to the delegates who don't represent them, and are only determined by the political party.	4,519	5	,904	,629	,678	Acceptance
Women representation is critical in politics	1,845	5	,369	,416	,837	Acceptance
"In the party of which I am a member, the needed importance was placed to the subject as "the representation of women".	8,192	5	1,638	1,708	,137	Acceptance
"The rate of woman representation in Turkey" is low compared with the other countries.	10,051	5	2,010	1,595	,166	Acceptance
"The representation rate of women" in municipality councils is not sufficient.	5,399	5	1,080	,910	,476	Acceptance
"The rate of women's representation" is not sufficient in local governments.	8,402	5	1,680	1,568	,173	Acceptance
I believe that the woman representatives in politics could produce solutions for "women" and "the problems of women"	7,761	5	1,552	1,775	,122	Acceptance
"Increasing the rate of the representation of women in politics" will contribute in the solutions of women.	6,044	5	1,209	1,423	,220	Acceptance

Table-13. e The results of the correlation analysis about the period which the municipality members live in Kahramanmaraş and the processes which they used for developing their own representation abilities

		How many years have you lived in Kahramanmaraş?	By giving the on the job training	Benefiting from the political academy	Benefiting from the experiences of elder members	Getting the help of political party	Self learning by the course of time
How many years have you lived in Kahramanmaraş?	Pearson Correlation	1	,157	,013	,196(**)	,196(**)	,075
	Sig. (2-tailed)		,057	,877	,017	,017	,362
	N	155	147	147	147	147	148

Note: * Correlation is significant at the level of 0.05.

H14: There exists a significant difference between how many years' municipality council members had lived in Kahramanmaraş and which fractions are represented in municipality councils.

Table-14. The analysis of the correlation analysis about how many years the municipality council members had lived in Kahramanmaraş and which fractions are represented in municipality council

		How many years have you lived in Kahramanmaraş?	Women	Youngsters	The handicapped people	Elder people
How many years have you lived in Kahramanmaraş	Pearson Correlation	1	,095	,089	,076	,276(**)
	Sig. (2-tailed)		,253	,284	,360	,001
	N	155	147	147	147	147

** Correlation is significant at the level of 0.01.

The aim of hypothesis is to investigate the interaction between the time period in which the council members spent in their living city and which fractions are represented in the council. The result of the correlation analysis existed in the Table 18, which is about how many years the council members spent in Kahramanmaraş and which fractions are represented in the councils. Only for between the “elder people” fraction ($p=0,001<0.01$) and the period which the council members spent in Kahramanmaraş, a significant relevance was found. This relation is significant and positive at the level of $p=0,001<0.01$. Briefly stated, when the period, which the council members lived in Kahramanmaraş increased, the rate on representing the elder people's fraction also increases. According to it is seen that H14 hypothesis is accepted.

H15: There exists no difference between the political parties to which the council members belong and the representation characteristics of them

The aim of hypothesis is determine the relation between the political parties of council members and the representation characteristics of them. The variance (ANOVA) analysis was performed in order to determine that whether there exists a difference between the representation characteristics of council members and the political parties to which they belong. It is seen that there exist a significant difference between the political parties of which the council members are the members and the representation characteristics. Indeed, H15 was rejected for some articles, but accepted on behalf of the other articles. In other words, the council members show differentiations based on their political parties on behalf of the postulates as 'the very good perspective of men upon women and woman politicians', 'the council members' representing the society which voted for him', 'the local society's being effective upon the determination of council members which was performed by political parties', 'the existence of the local people's interest upon the decisions made by the council', 'the sufficient representation of society's all fractions in the council', and 'after the elections, their being loyal to the demands and the willing of political parties they are bound to.'

3. CONCLUSION

When the results of the study, which are related with political / indirect representation were paid attention, the following conclusions could be stated as

- Political representatives are effective upon the decisions made by the councils in Kahramanmaraş (76.8 %). Besides, the council members state that they were loyal to the political demand and requests of the political parties they were bound to (54.8%). In this respect, this might mean that the municipality council members were the representatives of the political parties. Yet, the council members stated that they represented the local

society by 89.7 %, and the local society was also effective upon the decision made by them at 68.4.

- As is seen in many studies which were performed in Turkey as well, the majority of municipality council was composed of craftsmen and little artisans 43.2%. This also shows that the craftsmen and artisans were sufficiently represented in the municipality councils of Kahramanmaraş province. Indeed, when the number of self-employed people (19.666) and the rate of population (1.85%) were paid attention, it is seen that the self-employed people are the majority in Kahramanmaraş and represented fairly in the municipality councils.
- According to the data published in the year 2015, which is about datum of the year 2014, the total woman population in Kahramanmaraş is 535.545 (49,18%). When we look at the representation of women in municipality councils by means of Turkish Institution of Statistics (TÜİK, 2015) it seems insufficient (10,3 %).
- As is paid attention to the voter profile in General Local Elections, the total number of voters around 18-39 years old has the ratio in the total number of voters around 53% in Kahramanmaraş (TÜİK, 2014). When the results of study are seen, it is found that 85.7 % of council members are 37 and nearly above years old, being known as middle aged people. Moreover, although the young population in Kahramanmaraş is heavy, it is seen that the representation of middle aged people in municipality councils is a matter of fact, and the representability of youngsters is insufficient. In other words, the elder municipality council members are fairly represented in municipality councils.

REFERENCES

- Aksu, H. and H. Kurtulus, 2011. Yerel Temsil ve Katılım Açısından Sivas Belediye Meclisi. Türk İdare Dergisi, 8(15): 113-132.
- Çitçi, O., 1996. Temsil, Katılma ve Yerel Demokrasi. Çağdaş Yerel Yönetimler Dergisi, 5(6): 5-14.
- Oktay, T., 2013a. Yerel Siyaset Bağlamında Belediye Meclis Komisyonlar. İstanbul: MBB Yayını, s.26.
- Örs, B., 2006. Siyasal temsil. İstanbul: İstanbul Üniversitesi Siyasal Bilgiler Fakültesi Dergisi.
- Toplak, J., 2003. Preferential vote and its use in Slovenia. Lex Localis, 1(2): 15-43.
- TÜİK, 2014. TÜİK Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu. Available from <http://www.tuik.gov.tr> [Accessed 12.03.2014].
- TÜİK, 2015. TÜİK Türkiye İstatistik Kurumu. Available from <http://www.tuik.gov.tr/ilGostergeleri/iller/K.MARAS.pdf> [Accessed 15.01.2015].
- Yildirim, S., 1993. Yerel Yönetim ve Demokrasi: Kavramlar. İstanbul: Yaklaşımlar.

Views and opinions expressed in this article are the views and opinions of the authors, Asian Development Policy Review shall not be responsible or answerable for any loss, damage or liability etc. caused in relation to/arising out of the use of the content.