

WORKPLACE SPIRITUALITY ENHANCE ORGANISATIONAL COMMITMENT IN THE SCHOOL MANAGEMENT



Al Amin Mydin¹⁺
 Abdul Ghani
Kanesan Abdullah²
 Anwar Allah
Pitchay³

^{1,2}School of Educational Studies, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Jalan Minden, Penang, Malaysia

¹Email: alamin@usm.my Tel: 6134166506

²Email: agk@usm.my Tel: 60134214686

³School of Management, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Jalan Minden, Penang, Malaysia

³Email: anawarap@usm.my Tel: +60135332427



(+ Corresponding author)

ABSTRACT

Article History

Received: 8 January 2018

Revised: 5 February 2018

Accepted: 8 February 2018

Published: 12 February 2018

Keywords

Workplace spirituality
Meaning of work
Sense of community
Alignment of values
Organizational commitment
Affective commitment
Continuative commitment
Normative commitment

The existing literature suggested that in the profitable organizations, workplace spirituality made a remarkable impact. The purpose of this study is to explore the existence of workplace spirituality in the non-profitable organization focus in school and the second purpose of the study is to see the role of workplace spirituality to enhance the organizational commitment among teachers. A sample 988 teachers from 87 public school in Malaysia took part in a survey. The data of this quantitative research was analyzed statistically. The result indicates that the level of workplace spirituality is high. Meanwhile for the for the hypotheses testing, all the dimensions of workplace spirituality is the predictor of affective and normative commitment. This shows that workplace spirituality influence the emotion of the teachers that encourage teachers to work beyond expectation. The implication of the shows that workplace spirituality is seen in a non-profitable organization and its' function can boost organization commitment. The practical implication is that school administrator should consider the dimensions of workplace spirituality like meaningful at work, sense of community and alignment of organizational values at the tool for improving teachers' attitude and commitment.

Contribution/ Originality: This study is one of the very few studies which have investigated the condition of workplace spirituality and organizational commitment in the context school setting, especially in the Malaysian education system. This indicates that emotionally attached teachers stay loyal to their school to prove the existence of workplace spirituality and organizational commitment.

1. INTRODUCTION

It is proven empirically that workplace spirituality has a major impact in an organization regardless of whether the organization is a profitable or non-profitable organization (Polley *et al.*, 2005). The ability of the organization to adopt and adapt spirituality in the organization can be key factor to increase productivity, innovation, creativity, performance, and pleasure to work organization. On the other hand, workplace spirituality can bring positive impact on the employee because it brings happiness and joyfulness at work which will make the working meaningful place for the employee (Ashmos and Duchon, 2000; Milliman *et al.*, 2003; Rego and Pina, 2008). Many organizations had used workplace spirituality as an enhancement tool to solve human capital the organization and this created a new phenomenon which is very special (Dhiman and Marques, 2011).

Whereas organizational commitment has become a much-researched subject throughout this millennium (Joolideh and Yeshodhara, 2009). This interesting part of this organizational behavior bring goodness in the organization such as increase the output, encourage innovative behavior, increase productivity and enhance quality and efficiency (Duchon and Plowman, 2005; Chang and Chen, 2012; Zhao, 2014; Alas and Mousa, 2016). An organization that promotes workplace spirituality and organizational commitment can cause marvelous impacts on the overall aspect of an organization.

2. BACKGROUND

2.1. Workplace Spirituality

Workplace spirituality is synonymous with an enjoyable working experience in the workplace that lead to an increase in work productivity (Janfeshan *et al.*, 2011). The enjoyable working atmosphere which lead an employee to happiness at work because the working not only merely for the sake for earning income but it is more than that. Employees feel the workplace is a meaningful place that play vital role in their life. According Maslow (1954) working for self-satisfaction will bring meaningful consequences in employee and this is positive (Milliman *et al.*, 2003).

Ashmos and Duchon (2000) explore workplace spirituality with seven dimensions which are the inner life as spiritual identity, meaning and purpose in work, a sense of connection and community, block of spirituality, personal responsibility, positive connections with other individual and contemplation. These researchers focus their study in the field of organization behavior which concentrate more on the phycology, motivation and theology. Whereas Milliman *et al.* (2003) made some modification with these dimensions and come up with new set of workplace spirituality dimensions which focuses on phycology and motivation. These researchers come to conclusion that the dimensions of workplace spirituality can categorized into individual level, group level and organization level.

The first dimension proposed by Milliman *et al.* (2003) is meaningful at work and this particular dimension focuses spirituality at individual level (Petchsawang and Duchon, 2009; Janfeshan *et al.*, 2011; Nasina and Koh, 2011). Even though the first dimension is at individual level but it more about the feeling towards work, workplace and organization. Hence the meaningful at work can be seen at individual level when employee appreciate their work. They look forward to come to work and they are energized by their work which will lead to the highest contribution to the organization he or she belongs to. Besides that employee senses a special feeling towards everything related to work, colleagues and his organizations (Rego *et al.*, 2007).

The meaningfulness at work behavior shown by employee will lead to the second dimension which sense of community and this group level. Neal and Bennet (2000) gave extra flavor for this particular dimensions by describing it as “esprit de corps”. Esprit de corps can be defined as a show of fidelity and affection to a group with which one identifies. In addition to the fidelity and attachment, esprit de corps could also embody a sense of commitment. The energy generated by esprit de corps may be self-satisfying when it is directed toward oneself in helping to establish an identity (Grosz, 2008). The relationship among co-workers flourish as they treat each other like a family member to perform daily task as a part of working community (Ahmadi and Derakhshan, 2014). The important criteria would be working together to the benefit organization and problem are faced in group as family whether it is job related or personal. The bondage between workers are so close that employee try to bring their own family in the community at work Milliman *et al.* (2003).

Meanwhile the third dimensions of workplace spirituality is align with organizational values which is organizational level Milliman *et al.* (2003). Every organization has its' sets of mission, vision, objective and values. The ability of a leader to lead the organization is very crucial because as leader should be able to impart mission, vision, objective and values of the organization and this will be the pillar of the organization (Podsakoff *et al.*, 2000). Besides imparting the objectives of the organization, the organization should show concern toward its employees

(Fanggida *et al.*, 2016). Caring organization will make organization member to feel connected to organization. Knowing the problem of the organization members, showing concern and helping should be the spirit shown by organization.

2.2. Organizational Commitment

In 1987, Meyer and Allen developed a commitment model, in three forms which are affective commitment, continuance commitment and normative commitment (Hakimian *et al.*, 2016). The first form is affective commitment which refers to identification with, involvement and emotional attachment to the organization (Hakimian *et al.*, 2016). Employees that shows a strong affective commitment will continue to be a part of the organization because they are enthusiastically feel so. With this it shows a positive interaction between the individual and the organization because both share the same values (Joolideh and Yeshodhara, 2009; Ohana and Meyer, 2016). Affectively committed employees tend to work longer hours to serve the mission of the organization they feel they belong to.

Meanwhile the second form commitment which is the continuance commitment shows the need by employees to stay with an organization because the cost of leaving is too great or the remuneration factor (Hakimian *et al.*, 2016). Meyer and Allen (1997) revealed that employees with strong continuance commitment may not necessarily want to contribute to their employed organization. Indeed, staying with the organization only because of the high cost of leaving may create feelings of frustration which lead to inappropriate behaviors. Since continued employment is essential for the employee to be with the organization, Meyer and Allen (1991) indicated a link between continuance commitment and on-the-job behavior (Hakimian *et al.*, 2016). There is thus difficulty in “giving it up” and the unknown “opportunity cost” of leaving the organization or having few or no alternatives (Joolideh and Yeshodhara, 2009).

Normative commitment refers to commitment based on a sense of obligation to the organization. Employees with strong normative commitment remain because they feel they ought to do so. As can be seen, all three components of commitment have straightforward implications for staying with (or leaving) an organization, but beyond that, are conceptually quite different (Allen and Meyer, 1996). Research by Munene and Dul (1989) showed that normative commitment is not derived from education, pay or age, but refers to the feeling of mutual trust that establishes an obligation to stay with the organization (Hakimian *et al.*, 2016). Normative commitment might also develop because of the “psychological contract” between an employee and the organization (Rousseau, 1995). Normative commitment can increase when an individual feels loyal to his employer or responsible to work for the benefits that he gets from the organization as a result of the desire to compensate the favors received from the institution (Meyer *et al.*, 1993; Curtis and Day, 2013).

3. HYPOTHESES

- a) H1 : There is significant correlation between dimensions of workplace spirituality and organizational commitment
- b) H2 : There is significant relationship between workplace spirituality and normative commitment
- c) H3 : There is significant relationship between workplace spirituality and continuative commitment
- d) H4 : There is significant relationship between workplace spirituality and affective commitment

4. METHODOLOGY

4.1. Sample

Overall 988 Malaysian teachers from 87 public secondary schools in the state of Penang, Malaysia. The sample consisted of 22 percent (218) males and 78 percent (771) females. The working experience of the teachers ranged from below 5 years; 14 percent (141) experience from 6 to 10 years; 30 percent (305); experience 11 to 19 years 44

percent (415) and experience more than 20 years 12 percent (128). Meanwhile, the teachers with PhD qualification are only less than 1 percent (4), master degree 11 percent (107), Bachelor degree 82 percent (830), diploma 4 percent (34) and teaching certificate 2 percent (14).

4.2. Instrument

The instrument for this research is divided into three parts. The first part of the instrument is the demography which consist information like respondents' gender, working experience, academic qualification, types of school and the gender of respective school principal. Whilst second part questionnaire by Milliman *et al.* (2003) which was translated to Malay and adapted from Ashmos and Duchon (2000) that represent workplace spirituality. The actual context of instrument was based on profitable organization but for the sake of these research the instrument was adapted to the school organization has gone through validation process and it is fit to do research. There were 20 items that represented dimension of meaningful at work (6 items), dimension of sense of community (6 items) and dimension organizational values (8 items). The last part of instruments is questionnaire with 24 items that represented organizational commitment (Meyer *et al.*, 1993). This questionnaire were divided into three type commitment, affective commitment (9 items), continuative commitment (8 items) and normative commitment (7 items). Both the questionnaire used a five-point Likert scale ranging from point strongly disagree, disagree, neutral, agree and strongly agree.

5. FINDINGS

The initial step before analyzing critically the items had gone through a reliability test process which the findings shows that the workplace spirituality scale consisted of 17 items ($\alpha = .93$), while the first dimension which is meaningful at work consisted of 4 items ($\alpha = .83$), sense of community consisted of 6 items ($\alpha = .84$) and align with organizational values consisted of 4 items 7 ($\alpha = .93$).

Table-1. Cronbach's Alpha Value for Workplace Spirituality

Dimension Workplace Spirituality	Cronbach's Alpha Value
Meaningful at work	.83
Sense of Community	.84
Align with Organizational Values	.93
Overall	.93

Source: Data Retrieved From: Universiti Sains Malaysia Short Term Research Grant Entitled Model of School Improvement by Al Amin Mydin, 2017. (Unpublished Report)

Meanwhile, in table 2 shows that items for organizational commitment scale consisted of 18 items ($\alpha = .93$), while the first subscale affective commitment consisted of 10 items ($\alpha = .93$), second subscale is continuative commitment of 3 items ($\alpha = .77$) and the third subscale is normative commitment ($\alpha = .86$).

Table-2. Cronbach's Alpha Value for Organizational Commitment

Organizational Commitment	Cronbach's Alpha Value
Affective Commitment	.93
Continuative Commitment	.77
Normative Commitment	.86
Overall	.93

Source: Data Retrieved From: Universiti Sains Malaysia Short Term Research Grant Entitled Model of School Improvement by Al Amin Mydin, 2017. (Unpublished Report)

Table-3. Intercorrelation between Dimensions of Workplace Spirituality and Organizational Commitment

		AC	CC	NC	MAW	SOC	AOV
1	AC	-					
2	CC	.53**	-				
3	NC	.64**	.46**	-			
4	MAW	.49**	.27**	.37**	-		
5	SOC	.42**	.31**	.33*	.55*	-	
6	AOV	.55**	.32**	.42**	.55*	.50**	-

Notes: *p>0.05; **p>0.01, AC = Affective Commitment, CC= Continuative Commitment, NC = Normative Commitment, MAW= Meaningful at Work, SOC= Sense of Community & AOV = Align with Organizational Values

Table 4 indicates that all level dimensions the of workplace spirituality were quite highly practice among the teachers. This also indicates teachers are consider highly spirited when it comes to their profession. Overall the intercorellations are positive and weak except correlation between organization values and affective commitment which positive moderate level. Findings indicate that *H1* is rejected because of weak correlations.

Table-4. Level of Workplace Spirituality

	Dimension	Mean	SD	Level
1.	Meaningful at Work	3.91	.63	High
2.	Sense of Community	4.46	.51	High
3.	Alignment of Values	3.68	.71	High
	Overall	4.01	.51	High

Source: Data Retrieved From: Universiti Sains Malaysia Short Term Research Grant Entitled Model of School Improvement by Al Amin Mydin, 2017. (Unpublished Report)

Based on the table 5, workplace spirituality influence 23 percent of the change variance of normative commitment. This shows that dimension of meaningful at work ($\beta = .17$; $p < .00$); dimension of sense of community ($\beta = .09$; $p < .01$) and dimension of alignment of values ($\beta = .28$; $p < .00$) significantly influenced normative commitment. The output also shows that the dimension of alignment of values ($\beta = .28$; $p < .05$) is the best predictor of normative commitment. Findings indicated that *H2* is accepted.

Table-5. Coefficient Value of the Effect Workplace Spirituality on Organizational Commitment

Predictor	Commitment		
	Normative β	Continuative β	Affective β
MAW	.17**	.09*	.27**
SOC	.09*	.14**	.21**
AOV	.28*	.21**	.36*
R Value	.48	.37	.62
R ² Value	.23	.14	.39
R ² Coefficient Value	.23	.14	.39
F Value	58.80**	31.32**	122.98**

Note: *p< .05, **p< .01, MAW= Meaningful at Work, SOC= Sense of Community & AOV = Align with Organizational Values

The regression analysis shows that workplace spirituality not significantly predicted continuative commitment. The results of the regression indicated the three predictors explained only 14% of the variance ($R^2 = .14$, $F(31.32) = .14$, $p < .01$), so *H3* is rejected.

Meanwhile the last output workplace spirituality significantly predicted affective commitment. The next result also shows that workplace spirituality significantly predicted normative commitment. The results of the regression indicated the three predictors explained 23% of the variance ($R^2 = .23$, $F(58.8) = .23$, $p < .05$) and *H4* is accepted.

6. DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

This study has attempted to examine the relationship between dimensions of workplace spirituality and organizational commitment (affective, continuative and normative commitment). The first finding based on the correlations shows that weak correlations between these variables that indicates dimensions of spirituality are in different form of construct compared to the organizational commitment and this shows it is applicable in research as two different sets of variables. Even though (Rego *et al.*, 2007) used these variables in their research, workplace spirituality instruments that were used had 5 dimensions. Furthermore, the population and sampling were wide range from private sectors and the location were in Brazil and Portugal. Whilst this research focuses only on teachers in Northern Region of Malaysia with bigger sample size so this research is a new findings so the findings focuses on the teachers' organizational behavior at school. Before further discussion, research also shows that the state of workplace spirituality among teachers are high and this indicates teachers are highly spirited when it comes to their profession and school. The dimensions of meaningful at work and sense of community scored the highest level. The findings about meaningful at work shows that teachers feels sense of enjoyment at work, teaching makes them feel happy, teaching is very important part of their life and teachers look forward to teach, these are some of the feelings found through this research. Meaningful at work also foster emotional attachment towards work and organization because the effect was positive in cultivating affective commitment. Because of emotional attachment with the organization teachers feel at home while at their workplace and this increase teachers' retention to leave their school. The responses showed also indicates that teachers feel that their work is interesting and this also the causing factor that make them feel affectively committed to their workplace. Teachers generally are proud with their profession and this element makes them to be passionate with their work at school. Feeling passionate at work make the teachers create effective learning environment, creative, dedicated to achieve good outcomes and able make positive changes in learning environment (Tuğrul, 2013).

Emotionally connected with work will make a teacher happy with the profession and everything related to the school. Another very important part of schooling system is the community. Research findings support that the teachers do really care about the community in their school and they are team players that create a teaching and learning community. Apart from that the coordination within the group members, this will enhance the group capacity that will lead to new synergistic (Branson, 2008). Another part of workplace spirituality that is alignment with organization values has impact affective commitment and this shows that the organizational goals, objectives, obligations and ideology contributed to affective commitment (Kathuria *et al.*, 2007; Branson, 2008).

The for workplace spirituality predicted that it could boost normative commitment and it means employee feels loyal to his organization or responsible to work for the benefits that he gets from the organization as a result of the desire to compensate the favors received from the organization (Joolideh and Yeshodhara, 2009). Teachers feel loyal to their school because of the policy, leadership style and organization values and further supported by alignment with organizational being one of the predictor. Loyalty to the school maybe the one of the factor that keep the teacher attach to the school and workplace spirituality can be factor increasing loyalty among the employee (Joolideh and Yeshodhara, 2009) .

Overall organizational behavior among teachers can be improved through cultivation workplace spirituality and organization commitment especially affective and normative commitment. Combination these elements in the human resource management proven in research finding but further research can be done by incorporating other organizational behavior such as job satisfaction, self-efficacy, perfectionism and others. As a conclusion combination of workplace spirituality and commitment may be the secret recipe in enhancing teachers' organizational behavior.

7. LIMITATION OF THE STUDY

This research focused on the teachers in secondary school and these school were located in the northern region of Malaysia. Data analyzed cannot represent teachers in Malaysia because the sample was not all over Malaysia. Furthermore, sample for this is only secondary school teachers. These findings don't reflect all level of teachers. Another thing lacking in this research is comparison between types of schools in Malaysia such as private schools, missionary schools, religious schools and other types of school available. Comparison between schools can give better insight related to workplace spirituality and organizational commitment. Collected data were in the form numerical but data can be more meaningful if the research done mix method with qualitative data supporting the findings.

Funding: This study received no specific financial support.

Competing Interests: The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

Contributors/Acknowledgement: All authors contributed equally to the conception and design of the study.

REFERENCES

- Ahmadi, S.A.A. and H. Derakhshan, 2014. The role of organizational spirituality in citizenship behavior in agriculture organization. Available from <http://isicenter.org/fulltext2/paper-274.pdf>.
- Alas, R. and M. Mousa, 2016. Organizational culture and workplace spirituality. *International Journal of Emerging Research in Management & Technology*, 5(3): 2278–9359. *View at Google Scholar*
- Allen, N.J. and J.P. Meyer, 1996. Affective, continuance, and normative commitment to the organization: An examination of construct validity. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 49(3): 252–276. *View at Google Scholar | View at Publisher*
- Ashmos, D. and D. Duchon, 2000. Spirituality at work: A conceptualization and measure. *Journal of Management Inquiry*, 9(2): 134–145. *View at Google Scholar | View at Publisher*
- Branson, C.M., 2008. Achieving organisational change through values alignment. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 46(3): 376–395. *View at Google Scholar | View at Publisher*
- Chang, C.H. and Y.S. Chen, 2012. The determinants of green intellectual capital. *Management Decision*, 50(1): 74–94. *View at Google Scholar | View at Publisher*
- Curtis, A. and A. Day, 2013. The impact of specialist training on professional identity, organisational membership, organisational commitment, and stress in correctional psychologists. *Journal of Forensic Practices*, 15(2): 130–140. *View at Google Scholar | View at Publisher*
- Dhiman, S. and J. Marques, 2011. The role and need of offering workshops and courses on workplace spirituality. *Journal of Management Development*, 30(9): 816–835. *View at Google Scholar | View at Publisher*
- Duchon, D. and D.A. Plowman, 2005. Nurturing the spirit at work: Impact on work unit performance. *Leadership Quarterly*, 16(5): 807–833. *View at Google Scholar | View at Publisher*
- Fanggida, E., E. Rolland, Y. Suryana, N. Efendi and Hilmiana, 2016. Effect of a spirituality workplace on organizational commitment and job satisfaction. (Study on the Lecturer of Private Universities in the Kupang City -Indonesia). *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 219: 639–646. *View at Google Scholar | View at Publisher*
- Grosz, R., 2008. Esprit de corps (The Value of Morale). *Internet Journal of Allied Health Sciences and Practice*, 6(4): 4. *View at Google Scholar*
- Hakimian, F., H. Farid, M.N. Ismail and P.K. Nair, 2016. Importance of commitment in encouraging employees' innovative behaviour. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Business Administration*, 8(1): 70–83. *View at Google Scholar | View at Publisher*
- Janfeshan, K., B. Panahy, S.M. Veisesh and F. Kamari, 2011. Spirituality in the work place and its impacts on the efficiency of management. In 2nd International Conference on Business and Economic Research (2nd ICBER 2011) Proceeding. Conference Master Resources.

- Joolideh, F. and K. Yeshodhara, 2009. Organizational commitment among high school teachers of India and Iran. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 47(1): 127–136. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Kathuria, R., M.P. Joshi and S.J. Porth, 2007. Organizational alignment and performance: Past, present and future. *Management Decision*, 45(3): 503–517. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Maslow, A., 1954. *Motivation and personality*. New York: Harper Collins.
- Meyer, J.P. and N.J. Allen, 1991. A three-component conceptualization of organization commitment. *Human Resource Management Review*, 1(1): 61-98. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Meyer, J.P. and N.J. Allen, 1997. *Commitment in the workplace: Theory, research, and application*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Meyer, J.P., N.J. Allen and C. Smith, 1993. Commitment to organizations and occupations: Extension and test of a three-component conceptualization. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 78(4): 538-551. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Milliman, J., A.J. Czaplewski and J. Ferguson, 2003. Workplace spirituality and employee work attitudes: An exploratory empirical assessment. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 16(3): 426–447. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Munene, J.C. and R.D. Dul, 1989. Exploring normative commitment with Nigerian extension workers. *Public Administration and Development*, 9: 169–183. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Nasina, M.D. and P.P. Koh, 2011. The workplace spirituality and affective commitment among auditors in big four public accounting firms: Does matter? *Journal of Global Mangement*, 2(1): 216-226.
- Neal, J. and J. Bennet, 2000. Examining multi-level or holistic spiritual phenomena in the work place. *Management Spirituality and Religion Newsletter*, Academy of Management: 1-2.
- Ohana, M. and M. Meyer, 2016. Distributive justice and affective commitment in nonprofit organizations: Which referent matters? *Employee Relations*, 38(6): 841-858. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Petchsawang, P.A. and Duchon, 2009. Measuring workplace spirituality and organizational performance in an Asia context. *Human Resource Development International*, 12(4): 459-468. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Podsakoff, P.M., S.B. MacKenzie, J.B. Paine and D.G. Bachrach, 2000. Organizational citizenship behaviors: A critical review of the theoretical and empirical literature and suggestions for future research. *Journal of Management*, 26(3): 513-563. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Polley, D., J. Vora and P.N. Subbanarasimha, 2005. Paying the devil his due: Limits and liabilities of workplace spirituality. *International Journal of Organizational Analysis*, 13(1): 50–62. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Rego, A. and C.M. Pina, 2008. Workplace spirituality and organizational commitment: An empirical study. *Journal of Organizational Change Management*, 21(1): 53-75. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Rego, A., E. Pina, M. Cunha and S. Souto, 2007. Workplace spirituality, commitment, and self-reported individual performance: An empirical study. *Management Research: Journal of the Iberoamerican Academy of Management*, 5(3): 163–183. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)
- Rousseau, D.M., 1995. *Psychological contracts in organization*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Ltd.
- Tuğrul, M.Ç., 2013. A passionate teacher: Teacher commitment and dedication to student learning. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 2(1): 2226–6348. [View at Google Scholar](#)
- Zhao, H., 2014. Relative leader-member exchange and employee voice: Mediating role of affective commitment and moderating role of Chinese traditionality. *Chinese Management Studies*, 8(1): 27-40. [View at Google Scholar](#) | [View at Publisher](#)

Views and opinions expressed in this article are the views and opinions of the author(s), Asian Journal of Public Administration and Law shall not be responsible or answerable for any loss, damage or liability etc. caused in relation to/arising out of the use of the content.